

Media Portrayals of Minorities Project

Appendix to the Report on Media Portrayals

2019 Newspaper Coverage of African Americans, Asian Americans, Native Americans, Latinos, Jews, and Muslims

Authors: Erik Bleich, Mira Chugh, Adrienne Goldstein, Lukas Kauth, Kai Milici, Amelia Pollard, Varsha Vijayakumar, Emily Wander, and A. Maurits van der Veen
Data Visualizations: Mira Chugh
Layout & Design: Diana Diaz

For media or other inquiries, please contact Erik Bleich, Director, Media Portrayals of Minorities Project, ebleich@middlebury.edu.

Recommended citation: Media Portrayals of Minorities Project (2020) *Appendix to the Report on Media Portrayals: 2019 Newspaper Coverage of African Americans, Asian Americans, Native Americans, Latinos, Jews, and Muslims*. Middlebury College, Middlebury, Vermont.

Methodology

Collecting our Data

We use LexisNexis, NexisUni, ProQuest, and Factiva databases to identify articles from all sections of The New York Times, The Washington Post, The Wall Street Journal, or USA Today between January 1, 2015 and December 31, 2019 that contain root words associated with each of our groups. These root words are as follows (with an ! indicating a search for words with any one or more letter following the root):

African Americans: "African American!" OR "African-American!"

Asian Americans: "Asian American!" OR "Asian-American!"

Native Americans: "Native American!" OR "American Indian!"

Latinos: Latino! OR Latina! OR Latinx! OR Hispanic!

Jews: Jew OR Jews OR Jewish! OR Jewry OR Judai! OR Jewess!

Muslims: Muslim! OR Islam!

We subsequently eliminated articles unrelated to our topics of interest by dropping those containing only mentions of unrelated words such as "Latinate" or "Islamabad." We did not search for root words such as "Chinese American" or "Mexican American" that would capture subsets of our groups; we did not include words like "Torah" or "Quran" that invoke but do not name Jews or Muslims; and we excluded "black" because it is present in a large number of articles unrelated to our interests. These choices ensure that all articles in our dataset are directly related to our groups of interest. We retained all articles for our five-year analyses, and created a separate set of articles from 2019 for our one-year analyses.

Topic Modeling & Features

To identify general themes within our media data, we used latent semantic analysis with non-negative matrix factorization. We ran topic models on the 2019 data for each of our six groups. We iterated between 10-15 topics, and selected the number of topics with maximum coherence within that range. The results yield a list of 25 words associated with each topic.

There were a series of topics that recurred across all groups related to six general themes: culture, education, economics, politics, bigotry, and law and order. Using the results of the topic modeling, we created a list of words associated with each theme. Each article was then assessed for the presence of one or more words related to the theme, and tagged for the thematic feature if a related word was present in the article.

Through our process, we create "features" for each concept. This allows us to identify articles containing one or more of the words associated with each feature. The feature words associated with each general theme are (with an * indicating a search for words with any one or more letter following the root):

- *Culture*: artist*, museum*, exhibition*, galler*, painting*, sculpture*, architecture, opera, musical, film, movie*, art, arts, mural*, theater*
- *Education*: education*, student*, academi*, professor*, teacher*, school*, standardized test*, college*, universit*, graduat*, alum*, admissio*, affirmative action, teach, taught, teaching
- *Economics*: unemploy*, econom*, job*, wage*, recession, market, employ*, tax, taxes, worker*, trade, trading, labor*
- *Politics*: democrat*, republican*, governor*, gubernat*, candidate*, senat*, congress*, donald trump*, donald j trump*, president trump*, campaign*, vote*, voting, ballot*, politic*, elect, elects, elected, election*, electoral
- *Bigotry*: racis*, bigot*, discriminat*, prejudice*, hate group*, hate crime*, xenopho*, anti immigra*, anti-immigra*, antiimmigra*, antisemit*, anti-semit*, anti semit*, islamophobia, islamophobic, islamophobe*, anti muslim, anti-muslim, antimuslim
- *Law and order*: police*, crime*, criminal*, law enforce*, prison*, jail*, arrest*, court, courts, attorney, legal, jury, juries, juror*, verdict*, prosecutor*, convict*, testif*, lawyer*, robber*, rape*, manslaughter*, homici*, assault*, kidnap*, burglar*, theft*, felon*, misdemeanor*, drug possession, unarm*, shooting*, shooter*, incarcerat*

Below we present the 25 words associated with each topic for the individual groups. We exclude topics that do not capture an identifiable concept. These results provide the foundation for identifying the general themes, and also reveal specific themes associated with each group. Following the list of topics, we provide the features we generated to explore the presence and associations with each specific theme for the group.

African Americans

Topics

- Topic 2: art, museum, artists, artist, exhibition, gallery, paintings, painting, works, museums, collection, curator, contemporary, galleries, arts, moma, sculpture, exhibitions, painter, modern, design, photographs, abstract, photography, studio
- Topic 3: biden, warren, candidates, sanders, voters, democratic, buttigieg, harris, campaign, booker, candidate, iowa, presidential, senator, democrats, primary, debate, vice, polls, president, bernie, obama, kamala, party, trump
- Topic 5: northam, fairfax, virginia, blackface, governor, yearbook, resign, herring, gov, richmond, ralph, lieutenant, justin, state, allegations, assault, lt, resignation, democrats, virginians, sexual, attorney, general, caucus, page
- Topic 7: police, officers, officer, shooting, department, city, mayor, shot, county, killed, enforcement, investigation, chief, charges, prosecutors, prosecutor, charged, crime, tuesday, authorities, fired, car, force, community, arrest
- Topic 8: slavery, enslaved, slaves, reparations, slave, descendants, confederate, war, history, civil, americans, africans, emancipation, confederacy, virginia, ancestors, freed, georgetown, reconstruction, states, 1619, historical, jefferson, monuments, plantation
- Topic 9: trump, democrats, republican, republicans, democratic, house, party, president, election, voters, vote, political, democrat, parliamentx, campaign, committee, gop, senate, 2020, congressional, pelosi, cummings, elections, votes, speaker
- Topic 10: film, theater, movie, oscar, movies, comedy, production, films, music, dance, musi-

cal, director, actor, org, drama, play, broadway, hollywood, directed, series, pm, festival, val, best, plays

- Topic 11: nfl, league, players, kaepernick, teams, team, season, player, game, bowl, anthem, quarterback, sports, football, super, 49ers, coach, baseball, colin, coaches, games, robinson, played, goodell, sport
- Topic 12: court, law, justice, supreme, judge, case, criminal, attorney, legal, amendment, prison, rights, cases, state, laws, prosecutors, voting, trial, decision, lawsuit, sentences, convicted, judges, convictions, ruling
- Topic 14: students, schools, school, student, education, teachers, college, campus, charter, colleges, parents, admissions, district, high, class, university, universities, teacher, board, academic, classes, children, enrollment, scores, public
- Topic 15: health, patients, disease, medical, care, prevention, rates, treatment, deaths, hiv, risk, doctors, drug, medicine, opioid, study, rate, epidemic, patient, researchers, hospital, cancer, data, overdoses, centers

Group-Specific Features

- *Slavery*: slave*, enslave*
- *1619 Project*: 1619
- *Governor Northam*: governor northam*, ralph northam*
- *Health*: health*, patients, hospital, doctor, doctors, treatment, disease, medicin*, drug*, infect*, opioid*, overdose*, cancer*

Asian Americans

Topics

- Topic 1: trump, president, think, women, country, political, states, black, state, united, americans, family, work, want, america, democratic, know, house, party, life, california, really, history, good, going
- Topic 2: schools, specialized, stuyvesant, students, exam, blasio, school, city, high, hispanic, test, mayor, plan, admissions, black, elite, bronx, education, selective, integration, admission, brooklyn, public, middle, seats
- Topic 3: biden, candidates, buttigieg, warren, sanders, booker, harris, debate, democratic, yang, candidate, senator, polls, voters, castro, iowa, poll, klobuchar, mayor, campaign, pete, gabbard, kamala, hampshire, bernie
- Topic 4: admissions, harvard, applicants, students, affirmative, court, judge, university, race, burroughs, supreme, colleges, schools, action, scores, admission, plaintiffs, college, universities, process, diversity, lawsuit, ruling, case, preferences
- Topic 5: misstated, jefferson, article, thomas, corrections, misidentifies, errors, page, tankers, academy, gulf, mentioned, schools, misstates, sunday, technology, pitt, high, comments, ny-times, picture, september, customercare, faxed, nytnews
- Topic 6: trademark, trademarks, brunetti, scandalous, registration, court, vulgar, immoral, provision, justices, amendment, marks, government, decision, tam, breyer, clothing, profanity, kagan, sommer, offensive, justice, slants, supreme, patent
- Topic 7: previews, org, theater, closes, opens, directs, nyc, playwright, play, jesse, musicals, publictheater, reviews, musical, curie, meditation, stars, broadway, shakespeare, november, weekend, brantley, plays, performances, green

- Topic 8: lin, nba, raptors, knicks, basketball, linsanity, teams, toronto, player, championship, jeremy, rock, career, players, season, guard, playoffs, taiwan, marcsteinnba, marc, 2012, sports, newsletter, minutes, lebron
- Topic 9: dreamworks, vietnam, territory, morey, censors, map, disputed, china, chinese, movie, film, sea, animated, box, international, kong, hong, claim, studio, line, tuoi, hiep, comcast, dips, remarked
- Topic 10: bans, ban, affirmative, action, capitalx, ballot, seattle, businesses, measure, repeal, shifting, state, weigh, voters, hicks, favored, minorities, restore, enterprises, vote, programs, supported, prohibitions, contracting, rusty
- Topic 11: yeti, sales, abominable, theaters, fluffy, weekend, astra, movie, dreamworks, animated, animation, box, ticket, distributed, domestic, yi, tickets, chapter, solid, trainor, rare, bennet, tenzing, rotten, 11dot5
- Topic 12: users, rainie, ad, privacy, affinities, ads, facebook, transparency, affinity, pew, leanings, information, consumers, advertisers, multicultural, algorithms, kiosk, user, consumer, lists, accurate, settings, page, survey, assigned
- Topic 13: hud, advertisers, advertising, ad, ads, users, housing, facebook, targeting, complaint, farías, tools, advertiser, characteristics, practices, discriminatory, platform, exclude, categories, companies, smyth, marketers, company, fair, investigation
- Topic 14: gretchen, carlson, nondisclosure, debate, stage, december, ignores, whiter, lack, judging, comparable, peitzmanstudio, gray, lawrence, suits, commentary, fox, julián, openly, reader, caucus, gop, smaller, perspective, cory

Group-specific features

- *Harvard affirmative action*: affirmative action, harvard
- *Stuyvesant High School*: stuyvesant*, stuyvesant high school*
- *De Blasio*: bill de blasio*, de blasio*
- *Model minority*: prominen*, elit*, success*, model minorit*, achieve*, excellen*

Native Americans

Topics

- Topic 1: white, state, history, black, states, work, country, school, world, women, national, family, day, city, united, life, america, government, public, think
- Topic 2: nw, exhibition, xxedu, xxi, ave, sw, museum, org, exhibited, folger, gallery, st, avenue, art, sculptures, artists, artist, works, independence, shakespeare
- Topic 3: warren, democratic, democrats, trump, voters, candidates, campaign, biden, sanders, senator, presidential, party, candidate, president, 2020, harris, iowa, election, race, elizabeth
- Topic 4: opioid, purdue, drug, settlement, trial, lawsuits, counties, epidemic, companies, opioids, crisis, addiction, johnson, pharma, attorneys, oxycontin, judge, distributors, litigation, plaintiffs
- Topic 5: cotter, farago, org, metmuseum, batman, leigh, sharks, guggenheim, exhibition, whitney, aquarium, punk, museum, cannon, biennial, stonewall, art, cycling, sendak, representations
- Topic 6: covington, phillips, sandmann, catholic, students, israelites, hebrew, diocese, videos, lincoln, video, school, encounter, memorial, nathan, boys, incident, march, media, high

- Topic 7: pm, val, festival, org, theater, free, museum, afi, saturday, sunday, music, nw, silver, 8633, colesville, dance, nyc, film, weekend, com
- Topic 8: shutdown, checks, paychecks, security, affected, payments, services, government, pay, january, workers, border, inspections, scull, gridlocked, missed, coast, food, emptied, contractors
- Topic 9: nw, exhibition, xxi, xxedu, sw, ave, org, stamps, museum, 2021, flowering, artist, art, st, manuscripts, avenue, gardens, independence, works, oprah
- Topic 10: warren, tribal, ancestry, dna, cherokee, test, presidential, apologized, claims, elizabeth, forum, campaign, ancestor, citizenship, haaland, pocahontas, iowa, released, leaders, controversy
- Topic 11: murals, arnautoff, board, francisco, san, mural, school, victor, frescoes, slaves, george, cook, yap, capitalx, panels, art, communist, painted, stevon, dead
- Topic 12: wolf, complaint, students, peck, propublica, education, district, healey, schools, department, investigation, lervick, investigate, school, point, discipline, fort, representing, investigations, letter
- Topic 13: misstated, corrections, incorrectly, article, errors, comments, nytimes, faxed, nytnews, customercare, 212, correction, newsroom, corrected, editorials, théâtre, referred, emailed, editions, delivery
- Topic 14: hart, dartmouth, mccain, conservatism, trilling, buckley, conservative, conservatives, iconoclastic, literature, bush, jeffrey, professor, burke, review, 88, kerry, columbia, enrolled, ben

Group-specific features

- *Warren*: elizabeth warren*, senator warren*
- *DNA*: dna, gene, genetic*
- *Opioids*: opioid*, purdue pharma*
- *Nathan Phillips*: nathan phillips*, covington catholic high school*, nick sandmann*
- *Victor Arnautoff*: arnautoff
- *Shutdown*: government shutdown

Latinos

Topics

- Topic 3: biden, candidates, warren, sanders, democratic, iowa, buttigieg, campaign, candidate, senator, voters, harris, presidential, booker, primary, bernie, castro, debate, elizabeth, democrats, pete, race, mayor, field, 2020
- Topic 4: students, schools, school, education, admissions, test, high, student, exam, teachers, specialized, charter, parents, scores, children, city, public, asian, black, academic, district, blasio, stuyvesant, integration, gifted
- Topic 5: census, citizenship, court, question, supreme, ross, commerce, administration, justice, ruling, justices, judge, decision, department, voting, bureau, add, hofeller, case, plaintiffs, rationale, adding, secretary, redistricting, count
- Topic 6: paso, shooting, el, mass, shootings, walmart, gunman, attack, manifesto, killed, dayton, terrorism, police, gun, violence, crusius, hate, texas, suspect, invasion, domestic, authorities, shooter, victims, supremacist
- Topic 7: border, immigration, migrants, migrant, agents, customs, patrol, detention, immi-

igrants, ice, undocumented, asylum, trump, security, administration, enforcement, children, facilities, homeland, detained, protection, raids, mexico, custody, families

- Topic 8: letters, opinion, nytopinion, publishing, tips, nytimes, editor, section, instagram, committed, facebook, email, hear, diversity, follow, articles, twitter, com, think, photograph, photo, racial, americans, black, america
- Topic 10: org, pm, nw, theater, val, st, ave, comedy, dance, 2700, rd, musical, improv, 14th, kennedy, arts, shakespeare, saturday, folger, olney, ne, dc, 1140, dcimprov, dollar
- Topic 11: pelosi, lawmakers, senate, house, democrats, funding, caucus, parliamentx, committee, shutdown, bipartisan, speaker, legislation, republicans, appropriations, border, trump, spending, representative, package, republican, nancy, congressional, deal, democrat
- Topic 12: voters, democrats, republican, republicans, election, party, democratic, trump, vote, turnout, elections, voter, 2020, 2016, political, votes, win, gop, state, campaign, presidential, poll, electorate, points, politics
- Topic 13: rate, economic, economy, americans, rates, workers, growth, jobs, higher, data, gains, unemployment, report, average, income, labor, health, compared, recession, study, wages, research, 000, dollar, lowest

Group-specific features

- *Immigration*: immigra*, migra*, refugee*, asylum*
- *Immigration broad*: immigra*, migra*, refugee*, asylum*, daca, deferred action for childhood arrivals, dreamer*, family separation*, 'family-separation*, caravan*, border*, border wall*
- *DACA*: daca, deferred action for childhood arrivals, dreamer*
- *El Paso shooting*: el paso, walmart AND shooting*, shooter*
- *Beto O'Rourke*: beto, o'rourke, o rourke, orourke
- *Julián Castro*: julián castro, julian castro
- *Stuyvesant*: stuyvesant*, stuyvesant high school*
- *NYC schools*: school integration, integration strike*, strike for integration
- *De Blasio*: bill de blasio*, de blasio*

Jews

Topics

- Topic 2: netanyahu, gantz, likud, election, minister, prime, parties, coalition, party, israel, israeli, arab, seats, blue, benny, knesset, government, voters, vote, benjamin, leader, elections, political, israelis, corruption
- Topic 3: org, exhibition, cotter, farago, museum, art, sharks, rex, aquarium, henson, artist, artists, display, stonewall, metmuseum, whitney, guggenheim, gallery, objects, visitors, punk, collection, queer, presents, smith
- Topic 4: measles, outbreak, vaccine, vaccination, health, cases, unvaccinated, vaccines, disease, outbreaks, vaccinated, exemptions, children, rockland, county, vaccinations, officials, virus, parents, vaccinate, cdc, immunization, spread, contagious, orthodox
- Topic 5: notice, deaths, paid, funeral, loving, val, ny, chapel, grandchildren, wife, survived, beloved, graduated, plaza, family, university, husband, services, school, board, donations, father, peacefully, devoted, community

- Topic 6: omar, democrats, democratic, trump, tlaib, israel, republicans, ilhan, parliamentx, house, republican, president, representative, pelosi, support, democrat, resolution, rep, comments, party, remarks, committee, bds, boycott, lawmakers
- Topic 7: police, attack, hate, synagogue, shooting, killed, crimes, violence, attacks, authorities, officials, crime, terrorism, enforcement, gunman, jersey, pittsburgh, community, suspect, prosecutors, officers, incidents, city, white, online
- Topic 8: mourns, condolences, ceo, extend, passing, chair, board, goldstein, notice, deaths, paid, eric, bressman, beloved, entire, heartfelt, family, moore, commitment, amy, dear, schoenfeld, kapito, president, unwavering
- Topic 9: holocaust, nazi, german, germany, war, nazis, poland, auschwitz, camp, camps, concentration, ii, jews, hitler, berlin, germans, polish, europe, museum, survivors, death, memorial, survived, prisoners, survivor
- Topic 10: pm, theater, org, val, nw, musical, comedy, dance, st, ave, 2700, saturday, music, play, dc, improv, stage, arts, 1140, dcimprov, festival, friday, sunday, com, Broadway
- Topic 11: palestinian, palestinians, israeli, israel, bank, west, netanyahu, settlements, peace, jerusalem, israelis, annexation, settlement, gaza, annex, solution, occupied, conflict, arab, territory, minister, prime, jordan, land, settlers
- Topic 12: trump, iran, president, administration, syria, pompeo, foreign, iranian, officials, nuclear, policy, united, security, states, saudi, secretary, allies, military, state, russia, region, middle, golan, government, minister
- Topic 13: xxi, nw, exhibition, xxedu, sw, ave, org, museum, art, xxa, gallery, artist, glenstone, stamps, manuscripts, se, xxm, artists, independence, 2021, avenue, gardens, folger, works, st

Group-specific features

- *Holocaust*: holocaust*, nazi*, auschwitz, concentration camp*, hitler
- *Measles*: measles
- *Ilhan Omar*: ilhan omar, congresswoman omar
- *Rashida Tlaib*: rashida tlaib, congresswoman tlaib
- *Israel/Palestine*: israel*, palestin*, gaza, netanyahu, hamas, west bank, jerusalem, tel aviv
- *Iran*: iran*
- *Jersey City*: kosher mart, jersey city AND shooting*, shooter*

Muslims

Topics

- Topic 1: trump, political, york, house, white, party, women, think, way, public, work, want, parliamentx, election, day, right, democrats, national, campaign, know, america, going, life, politics, democratic
- Topic 2: iran, iranian, nuclear, tehran, sanctions, oil, gulf, trump, administration, saudi, pompeo, revolutionary, persian, deal, tanker, arabia, rouhani, iranians, military, foreign, officials, corps, tankers, pressure, middle
- Topic 3: killed, attack, attacks, group, forces, islamic, militants, police, security, sri, military, suicide, lanka, officials, killing, civilians, capital, wounded, islamist, soldiers, iraq, army, sunday, local, fighters
- Topic 4: syria, turkey, turkish, kurdis, syrian, kurds, erdogan, troops, forces, fighters, trump,

isis, withdrawal, islamic, border, allies, military, northern, russia, recep, tayyip, sdf, withdraw, northeastern, iraq

- Topic 5: india, modi, kashmir, indian, pakistan, hindu, delhi, narendra, bjp, prime, minister, kashmiris, autonomy, kashmiri, jammu, indians, hindus, bharatiya, janata, pakistani, khan, muslims, party, citizenship, nationalist
- Topic 6: taliban, afghan, afghanistan, kabul, talks, peace, ghani, khalilzad, afghans, negotiations, withdrawal, doha, insurgents, troops, qatar, agreement, deal, ashraf, war, zalmay, forces, province, officials, negotiators, troop
- Topic 7: zealand, christchurch, shooting, gunman, ardern, mosques, mosque, manifesto, shootings, tarrant, massacre, attack, gun, online, hate, police, jacinda, mass, shooter, suspect, attacks, australia, facebook, terrorism, content
- Topic 8: china, chinese, xinjiang, beijing, uighurs, camps, xi, uighur, hong, kong, communist, trade, human, detention, ethnic, jinping, rights, internment, companies, region, surveillance, technology, muslims, minorities, crackdown
- Topic 10: israel, israeli, netanyahu, palestinian, gaza, palestinians, hamas, jerusalem, jewish, israelis, jews, benjamin, bank, aviv, tel, rockets, omar, prime, jihad, minister, gantz, rocket, tlaib, west, boycott
- Topic 11: court, case, prison, trial, myanmar, charges, prosecutors, rohingya, judge, justice, sentenced, convicted, law, lawyers, police, rights, crimes, kyj, suu, sentence, charged, guilty, lawyer, arrested, aung

Group-specific features

- *Terrorism*: terroris*, islamic state*, isis, isil, al qaeda*, al-qaeda*, suicide bomb
- *Extremism*: extremis*, radical*, fundamentalis*
- *ISIS*: islamic state*, isis, isil
- *Conflict*: violen*, fight*, fighting, combat, war, wars, warring, insurgenc*, rebel*, militant*, killing*, killed, casualties
- *Muslim ban*: ban, banning, banned, barring
- *Ilhan Omar*: ilhan omar
- *Syria*: syria*, assad
- *Sri Lanka*: sri lanka*
- *New Zealand*: christchurch, new zealand
- *Kurds*: kurds, kurdish

Lexical Sentiment Analysis

Our lexical sentiment analysis method evaluates every word in each article to see whether it appears in a lexicon (dictionary) of positive or negative words. The overall sentiment of an article is calculated by summing the positive and negative impacts of the words in the text, and scaling by the overall length of the article (so we have a sense of the density of positive and negative words).

No single sentiment analysis dictionary will do a perfect job of capturing all the positive and negative connotations of words in a particular set of texts. Instead, a lexicon's strength can vary depending on the general subject of the texts under analysis, the writing style of the texts, etc.

For this reason, we generate eight different measures of sentiment, using eight different, widely used sentiment dictionaries.

In addition, we take into account words that modify a sentiment, including negations (“not,” “hardly”) and intensifiers (“very,” “extremely”). When any one or more of these words directly precede a word in one of our lexica, the sentiment value of the latter is adjusted accordingly.

Next, in order to calibrate our sentiment values such that a 0 is equivalent to neutral sentiment, we have collected a large corpus of about 45,000 newspaper articles—with no restrictions as to subject or length—whose tone can be assumed to be representative of the average tone of newspaper articles in general. For each of our eight sentiment measures, we standardize the sentiments calculated for this representative corpus, so that the mean is 0 and the standard deviation is 1. Not only does this establish a neutral point for our sentiment—it also makes it possible to average our eight sentiment measures without biasing or overweighting the result towards any particular measure. We rescale the resulting measure to once again have a standard deviation of 1.

The same adjustments (individual standardization parameters as well as the final rescaling) can then be applied to any other set of texts, producing a sentiment value that is easily interpretable relative to the average US newspaper article.

Regression Analysis

We use standard ordinary least squares (OLS) multivariate regressions to estimate how strongly individual “features”—the presence of one or more words from a particular category in a text—are associated with more positive or more negative sentiment.

Our features simply code for the presence (1) or absence (0) of any one or more words from a category in a text. Since they are binary variables, the interpretation of the regression coefficients is relatively straightforward: the presence of a feature is associated with an expected increase in a text’s aggregate sentiment by an amount equal to the regression coefficient.

Note that this expected increase is subject to some standard caveats, of which we briefly mention two. First, estimates of the expected impact of a rare feature and a common feature may differ even when in actual articles their effect is similar. Second, some features co-occur regularly. The rate of co-occurrence is not high enough to raise worries about multicollinearity, but it does mean that it is important to think about which estimated effects are likely to reinforce or, conversely, counteract one another.

Additional Data

Article count by group and publication, 2019

	Publication	Articles with one or more mentions of the group	Articles with three or more mentions of the group
African Americans	New York Times	3,811	639
	Washington Post	1,958	420
	Wall Street Journal	364	45
	USA Today	217	11
Asian Americans	New York Times	441	93
	Washington Post	121	21
	Wall Street Journal	41	6
	USA Today	12	1
Native Americans	New York Times	1,085	196
	Washington Post	475	100
	Wall Street Journal	161	17
	USA Today	44	11
Latinos	New York Times	2,717	596
	Washington Post	951	171
	Wall Street Journal	312	53
	USA Today	120	24
Jews	New York Times	4,159	1,206
	Washington Post	1,078	312
	Wall Street Journal	492	153
	USA Today	72	20
Muslims	New York Times	5,499	1,904
	Washington Post	2,237	762
	Wall Street Journal	1,030	339
	USA Today	144	32

Multivariate Regression

Estimated associations between article tone and the six general themes

Culture	.486 (.012)
Education	.319 (.012)
Economics	.085 (.011)
Politics	-.171 (.013)
Bigotry	-.244 (.012)
Law and order	-.610 (.012)
Constant	-.126 (.015)
Adj R-squared	0.213
Number of articles	27,541

Note: Each cell gives the estimated coefficients from OLS regressions, with standard errors in parentheses. All coefficients are statistically significant at the $p < .001$ level.

Citations of Sources

Embedded URLs are accessible through the online version of the appendix at mediaandminorities.org/reports.

Summary of 2019 Findings

Page 1: Latinos and African Americans are the largest of these groups, constituting approximately 18% and 13% of the US population, respectively. Asian Americans are the next most numerous, at roughly 6%. Native Americans, Jews, and Muslims make up approximately 1-2% of the American population.

[United States Census Bureau](#), 2018 estimates, accessed May 11, 2020.

[CIA World Factbook](#), accessed May 11, 2020.

African Americans

Page 7: In February, a racist photo believed to depict Virginia Governor Ralph Northam in blackface surfaced.

Blinder, Alan. "[Was That Ralph Northam in Blackface? An Inquiry Ends Without Answers](#)," The New York Times, May 22, 2019.

Page 7: Just one month later, three black churches in Louisiana were burned down in the span of 10 days.

Fausset, Richard. "[3 Black Churches Have Burned in 10 Days in a Single Louisiana Parish](#)," The New York Times, April 5, 2019.

Page 7: Other important topics included access to healthcare, protests over discriminatory policing, and The New York Times' "1619 Project," an initiative with the goal of reframing the "country's history by placing the consequences of slavery and the contributions of black Americans at the very center of our national narrative."

Silverstein, Jake. "[Why We Published the 1619 Project](#)," The New York Times, December 20, 2019.

Page 7: The only month in 2019 with a notable jump is February, when the case of Virginia Governor Northam broke, Cory Booker announced his presidential bid, and two African American women from Chicago went head-to-head in a historic mayoral race.

Guarino, Mark. "[In Crowded Chicago Mayoral Election, Women of Color Dominate the Field](#)," The Washington Post, December 30, 2018.

Page 7: President Trump created a storm of coverage after tweeting that "'Progressive' Democrat Congresswomen" should "go back" to the countries they came from.

Cummings, William. "[Trump tells congresswomen to 'go back' to the 'crime infested places from which they came'](#)" USA Today, July 14, 2019.

Page 9: A number of articles in The New York Times used the case of this photo as an impetus to investigate implicit bias in medical practices.

Carroll, Aaron E. "[Doctors and Racial Bias: Still a Long Way to Go](#)," The New York Times, February 25, 2019.

Eligon, John. "[Yearbook Pages at Northam's Medical School Recorded Both Memories and Prejudices](#)," The New York Times, February 5, 2019.

Asian Americans

Page 11: Specifically, the Harvard University affirmative action case received continued attention given accusations that the university intentionally discriminated against Asian American applicants.

Hartocollis, Anemona. "[Harvard Does Not Discriminate Against Asian-Americans in Admissions, Judge Rules](#)," The New York Times, November 5, 2019.

Page 11: Also, Stuyvesant High School, one of New York City's most selective public schools, garnered a fair amount of coverage for its higher admission rates of Asian American students compared to other racial groups.

Shapiro, Eliza & Wang, Vivian. "[Only 7 Black Students Got Into Stuyvesant, N.Y.'s Most Selective High School, Out of 895 Spots](#)," The New York Times, March 18, 2019.

Page 12: Asian Americans have long been portrayed as a "model minority" based on their presumed work ethic and cultural emphasis on education and discipline.

Lee, Stacey J. "[Behind the Model-Minority Stereotype: Voices of High- and Low-Achieving Asian American Students](#)." Anthropology & Education Quarterly 25, no. 4 (1994): 413-29.

Page 13: The verdict was somewhat controversial, given that it upheld Harvard's admission policies and found that the university's approach to affirmative action did not discriminate against Asian Americans.

Hartocollis, Anemona. "[Harvard Does Not Discriminate Against Asian-Americans in Admissions, Judge Rules](#)," The New York Times, November 5, 2019.

Page 13: De Blasio, a specific theme of 2019's coverage, was often discussed in regard to his proposal to diversify elite New York City schools, including Stuyvesant High School, by eliminating entrance exams in the admissions process.

Shapiro, Eliza & Wang, Vivian. "[Amid Racial Divisions, Mayor's Plan to Scrap Elite School Exam Fails](#)," The New York Times, June 24, 2019.

Native Americans

Page 15: Substantial coverage of politics occurred in January and February, and high article counts in May and August appear mainly due to legal disputes regarding Purdue Pharma: formal litigation started in May, and in August the pharmaceutical company began to reach settlements with many plaintiffs.

Strickler, Laura. "[Purdue Pharma offers \\$10-12 billion to settle opioid claims](#)." NBC News, August 27, 2019.

Page 17: Many in the Native American community reacted angrily to what they viewed as an attempt by Senator Warren to gain political capital without being actively engaged in their culture.

Khalid, Asma. "[Warren Apologizes to Cherokee Nation For DNA Test.](#)" NPR, February 1, 2019.

Page 18: Footage of the event shows Sandmann smiling in the face of Phillips, while fellow students laugh, suggesting a disrespect for Phillips' Native American culture and practices.

Mervosh, Sarah. "[Viral Video Shows Boys in 'Make America Great Again' Hats Surrounding Native Elder.](#)" The New York Times, January 19, 2019.

Page 18: Nationwide, many Native American tribes, municipal, and state governments sued Purdue Pharma, the producer of OxyContin, claiming the pharmaceutical company was an early driver of the nation's opioid crisis, which has disproportionately affected Native Americans.

"[Injury Prevention in American Indian and Alaska Native Communities.](#)" Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, accessed April 29, 2020.

Latinos

Page 19: In the political realm, as the 2020 presidential campaigns took off, Latino voters were highlighted as the largest racial or ethnic minority group eligible to vote in the election.

Cilluffo, Anthony and Fry, Richard. "[An early look at the 2020 electorate.](#)" Pew Research Center Social and Demographic Trends, accessed May 10, 2020.

Page 19: Among the candidates, Julian Castro and Spanish-speaking Beto O'Rourke joined the race, the former establishing his stance as the only Latino candidate and the latter appealing to Latino voters by drawing a contrast with Trump's negative descriptions about immigrants and the US-Mexico border.

Oppenheimer, Andres. "[Beto O'Rourke is no Latino, but he may end up being Latinos' favorite candidate.](#)" Miami Herald, March 22, 2019.

Page 19: The shooter was later found to have targeted Mexicans and was charged with federal hate crimes.

"[El Paso Walmart shooting suspect charged with federal hate crimes.](#)" Aljazeera, February 7, 2020.

Page 19: Immigration was also a contentious topic, with the Supreme Court deciding that it would hear cases challenging the termination of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA).

"[DACA Heads to the U.S. Supreme Court.](#)" National Immigration Law Center, accessed May 10, 2020.

Page 19: The increase in articles touching on the two candidates is likely related to the fact that O'Rourke dropped out of the presidential race on November 1st and Castro ended up missing the cutoff for a democratic primary debate scheduled for the 20th of the month.

Burns, Alexander. "[Beto O'Rourke Drops Out of the Presidential Race.](#)" The New York Times, November 1, 2019.

Montellaro, Zach. "[Julián Castro to miss November debate.](#)" Politico, November 13, 2019.

Page 19: November also saw a notable rise in articles mentioning DACA, which can be attributed to oral arguments on Trump's termination of the program that were made before the Supreme Court on November 12th.

"[DACA Heads to the U.S. Supreme Court.](#)" National Immigration Law Center, accessed May 10, 2020.

Page 20: During 2019, the average monthly tone was fairly consistent other than a significant drop in August, when the Latino community in El Paso was targeted in the deadliest anti-Latino attack in American history.

Coulehan, Erin, Benner, Katie, and Fernandez, Manny. "[Federal Hate Crime Charges Filed in El Paso Shooting That Targeted Latinos.](#)" The New York Times, February 6, 2020.

Jews

Page 24: That action set off a series of conversations about American support for Israel, culminating with Trump accusing Jewish Democrats of a "great disloyalty."

"[Trump Accuses Jewish Democrats of 'Great Disloyalty.'](#)" The New York Times, August 20, 2019.

Page 25: In recent years, the amount of coverage of anti-Semitism has escalated, which is consistent with a rise in reported anti-Semitic incidents.

"[ADL H.E.A.T. Map.](#)" Anti-Defamation League, accessed August 2, 2020.

Muslims

Page 27: In February, Representative Ilhan Omar was embroiled in controversy when she was accused of publishing a series of anti-Semitic tweets.

Nelson, Cody. "[Minnesota Congresswoman Ignites Debate on Israel and Anti-Semitism.](#)" NPR.org, March 7, 2019.

Page 27: While the mass-shootings in Christchurch, New Zealand were perpetrated by an anti-Muslim white nationalist, the following month's Easter Sunday bombings in Sri Lanka concentrated the media's attention on Islamic extremism.

Roy, Eleanor Ainge. "[It Brings Everything Back: Christchurch Despairs over White Supremacist Attacks.](#)" The Guardian, August 14, 2019.

Harris, Shane, Ellen Nakashima, Souad Mekhennet and Joanna Siater. "[Sri Lankan Easter Bombings, Claimed by ISIS, Show the Group Maintains Influence Even Though its Caliphate is Gone.](#)" The Washington Post, April 24, 2019.

Page 27: President Trump announced his intention to withdraw US troops from the region in October, reigniting American newspapers' coverage of the conflict.

Barnes, Julian E. and Eric Schmitt. "[Trump Orders Withdrawal of U.S. From Northern Syria.](#)" The New York Times, October 13, 2019.

Page 30: First, in March, Muslim communities worldwide were devastated by the white-nationalist shootings at two mosques in Christchurch, New Zealand, which claimed the lives of 51 worshippers.

Roy, Eleanor Ainge and Charlotte Graham-McLay. "[Christchurch Gunman Pleads Guilty to New Zealand Mosque Attacks that Killed 51](#)." The Guardian, March 25, 2020.

Page 30: Then, the following month, a group of suicide bombers with links to the Islamic state carried out a series of coordinated attacks in Sri Lanka on Easter Sunday, killing over 250 and wounding more than 500.

"[Sri Lanka Attacks: What We Know and Don't Know](#)." The New York Times, April 24, 2019.

Page 30: On the other hand, President Trump's suggestion that Representative Omar and her progressive colleagues should "go back and help fix the totally broken and crime-infested places from which they came" was seen as promoting xenophobic, racist sentiment.

Cummings, William. "[Trump tells congresswomen to 'go back' to the 'crime infested places from which they came'](#)" USA Today, July 14, 2019.

Additional Sources for our Methods

For additional information on our methods, see <https://www.mediaandminorities.org/methods/>.

For scholarly publications that use our methods, see: <https://www.mediaandminorities.org/publications/>.